

Date of Hearing: June 18, 2024

ASSEMBLY COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

Mike Fong, Chair

SB 995 (Padilla) – As Amended April 2, 2024

**SENATE VOTE:** 37-0

**SUBJECT:** California State University: High-Quality Teacher Recruitment and Retention Act.

**SUMMARY:** Creates the High-Quality Teacher Recruitment and Retention Act as a pilot program to recruit high-quality teaching candidates at three California State University (CSU) campuses in partnership with three California Community College (CCC) campuses.

Specifically, **this bill:**

- 1) Establishes the High-Quality Teacher Recruitment and Retention Act.
- 2) Requires the Chancellor of the CSU, in consultation with the Chancellor of the CCCs, to develop a five-year pilot program to commencing with the 2025–26 school year, to recruit high-quality teaching candidates at three CSU campuses in partnership with three CCC campuses that apply to participate in the five-year pilot program.
- 3) Requires all of the following of the pilot program:
  - a) One pilot program shall be at a campus of the CSU that is located in a rural community;
  - b) Each pilot program at a CSU campus shall partner with a CCC that has applied to participate in the pilot program and is within close proximity to the CSU campus;
  - c) The pilot program shall comply with and build on the Student Transfer Achievement Reform (STAR) Act;
  - d) The pilot program shall implement transfer model curriculum (TMC) and an Associate Degree for Transfer (ADT) at a CCC campus that can then be completed at a campus of the CSU that will allow, but not require, a participating student to complete a baccalaureate degree and a teaching credential in four years; and,
  - e) The pilot program shall use dual enrollment practices to fulfill the transfer model curriculum, as needed.
- 4) Specifies that if a participating student completes their ADT at a CCC campus and is in good academic standing, the student shall be guaranteed admission to the teacher training program at the partnering campus of the CSU.
- 5) Requires the participating campuses of the CSU, in consultation with the partnering CCC district, to conduct marketing and outreach to local high schools to recruit a diverse pool of participating students.
- 6) Requires the participating CSU campuses and the partnering CCC districts to assign counselors to participating students to ensure they are completing the correct coursework during their participation in the pilot program, with the counselors being existing counselors

who work with students to meet the requirements for an ADT, a baccalaureate degree, and a teaching credential.

**EXISTING LAW:**

- 1) Requires the segments of higher education to develop an intersegmental common core curriculum in general education (GE) for the purpose of transfer. This common core curriculum is known as the Intersegmental General Education Transfer curriculum (IGETC). Any student who completes the IGETC course pattern is deemed to have completed the lower division coursework required for transfer to the UC or the CSU (Education Code (EC) Section 66720).
- 2) Requests UC to identify commonalities and differences in similar majors across all UC campuses and provide CCC students with the information in at least the top 20 majors (EC Section 66721.7).
- 3) Requires the governing board of each public postsecondary education segment to be accountable for the development and implementation of formal systemwide articulation agreements and transfer agreement programs, including those for general education or a transfer core curriculum, and other appropriate procedures to support and enhance the transfer function (EC Section 66738).
- 4) Requires the Chancellor of CSU, in consultation with the Academic Senate of the CSU, to establish specified components necessary for a clear degree path for transfer students, including specification of a systemwide lower division transfer curriculum for each high-demand baccalaureate major (EC Section 66739.5).
- 5) Establishes the STAR Act, which, in part, requires, commencing with the fall term of the 2011-12 academic year, a student that receives an associate degree for transfer to be deemed eligible for transfer in to a CSU baccalaureate degree when the student meets specified requirements. Requires a granting of this degree when a student:
  - a) Completes 60 semester or 90 quarter units eligible for transfer to the CSU and that includes the CSU General Education Breadth program for IGETC, and a minimum of 18 semester or 27 quarter units in a major area of emphasis as determined by the district; and,
  - b) Obtains a minimum grade point average of 2.0 (EC Section 66745, et seq.).
- 6) Establishes, until July 1, 2025, the Associate Degree for Transfer Intersegmental Implementation Committee (ADT IIC) for specified purposes, including to serve as the primary entity charged with the oversight of the ADT. Requires the ADT IIC, on or before December 31, 2023, to provide the Legislature with recommendations on certain issues impeding the scaling of the ADT and streamlining transfer across segments for students (EC Section 66749.8).

**FISCAL EFFECT:** According to the Senate Committee on Appropriations:

- 1) The CSU indicates that this bill could result in General Fund (GF) costs of between \$50,000 and \$100,000 per year for each of the three selected campuses for the duration of the pilot program. The campuses would require additional administrative support for outreach, coordination, and advising for students to implement the pilot program.
- 2) The CCC Chancellor's Office estimates one-time Proposition 98 GF costs of approximately \$60,000 for the three selected CCC to participate in the pilot program. These resources would be used to update policies and procedures regarding the availability of the teacher preparation program; update communication and outreach materials; and to coordinate with the CSU on implementation.

**COMMENTS:** *Purpose of the measure.* According to the author, "schools across California are struggling with the impacts of years of increased teacher retirements while enrollment in teacher credentialing programs decline sharply. Vulnerable communities are feeling impacts of this shortage most acutely as class sizes grow. We must act to ensure that our students have the instructions and the attention in the classroom they need to succeed. By building off the existing partnerships between California Community Colleges and California State Universities, we can broaden the pathways to a career in teaching by making it faster and more affordable. SB 995 is a crucial step towards ensuring that schools have enough teaching staff to serve the over 5.8 million K-12 students who call California home."

Further, the author contends that, "this bill will help to diversify the teacher force, which is shown to improve the educational outcomes of minority students. The bill will also help to reduce roadblocks and increase accessibility for minority and low income students who want to become a teacher. By reducing the cost of obtaining a teaching degree, this bill will make becoming a teacher easier and less expensive for all people."

*The TMC.* Transfer model curriculum provide the basis for ADTs offered by the CCC. Intersegmental faculty develop TMC for a number of the most commonly transferred majors. The TMC identify a set of lower-division courses in a major that will prepare CCC transfer students for the more-advanced coursework they will take as juniors and seniors at the CSU. Once a TMC is approved by faculty, community colleges use it to design an ADT for transfer in that particular major.

*Establishment of ADTs and the IIC.* Enacted over a decade ago, the ADT was designed to simplify the transfer maze at CCC. Since its enactment, the ADT has made significant strides in streamlining the transfer process for students, and has become a successful pathway to earning a bachelor's degree. The ADT is a two-year, 60 unit degree that guarantees admission to the CSU and participating private institutions of higher education. Students who earn an ADT are automatically eligible to transfer as an upper-division student in a bachelor's degree program and need only complete two additional years (an additional 60 units) of coursework to earn a bachelor's degree.

The ADT IIC was established in 2022 and is also known as the AB 928 Committee. The AB 928 Committee serves as the primary entity charged with the oversight of the ADT for the sole purpose of strengthening the pathway for students and ensures it becomes the primary transfer pathway in California between campuses of the CCC, the CSU, the University of California (UC), and participating independent institutions of higher education, so that more students can avail themselves of the ADT's benefits.

The AB 928 Committee is comprised of 16 members who are representative of a cross-section of stakeholders, including student, institutional, and faculty representatives from the CCC, CSU, and UC systems, along with representatives from the AICCU, members of educational equity and social justice organizations, and members with expertise in the science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM) fields and with expertise in higher education research that includes scholarship on student transfer issues in California.

In December 2023, the AB 928 Committee submitted their report of recommendations to the Governor and Legislature, which included recommendations on setting goals for increasing transfer rates and proposing a unit threshold for STEM degree pathways. These recommendations emerged from many months of discussions and deliberations, were rooted in guiding premises, research, and analysis. The AB 928 Committee offered recommendations with the understanding that California needs to continue to improve equity and equality in transfer student outcomes in order to sustain a productive workforce, thereby improving the well-being of the people of California and providing a fair opportunity for social and economic mobility.

AB 2057 (Berman), of the 2023-24 Legislative Session, as discussed below in this analysis, seeks to implement many of the policy recommendations of the AB 928 Committee report.

*Committee comments and amendments.* The way this measure is currently drafted, it would significantly impact the current process of the TMC and ADTs because each ADT and appropriate curriculum has to be articulated and agreed upon by both the CCC and CSU faculty. The process is very labor intensive and takes a great deal of time. Additionally, elements of the TMC and ADT are being streamlined, via recently enacted legislation (AB 928, Berman, Chapter 566, Statutes of 2021).

*This measure potentially could slow down the implementation process, and cause confusion for the practitioners.*

Additionally, the way the measure is currently drafted, it reads as though there is an equal comparison with baccalaureate degrees and post baccalaureate programs (in terms of the TMC and ADT). However, they are not the same; and the comparison is an apples to oranges one and not an apples to apples comparison. The ADT is solely meant for baccalaureate degree completion and assisting to ensure undergraduate degree seekers can complete their undergraduate degree within four years.

Further, the ADT and TMC have a hard unit cap in order to insure timely completion for ADT transfer students. Even with the hard cap, there is slight variation, depending on the undergraduate major.

The ADTs are solely for undergraduate degrees. Since becoming a teacher in California requires a baccalaureate degree and postgraduate level work for a teaching credential, an ADT would not be the appropriate avenue to achieve the goals of this measure. An ADT on its own would not meet the subject matter requirements of earning a teaching credential. Further, in order to create a new ADT, the ADT IIC would need to create and approve a new ADT pursuant to AB 928 (Berman, 2021), as discussed above and below.

Ultimately, there appears to be an inherent structural problem with how this measure is currently drafted, and trying to use the ADT and TMC model in order to expedite qualified teachers

entering the classroom, not just with a baccalaureate degree, but their appropriate teaching credential. Some credentials take longer to earn than others depending on the field of study.

The CSU and many independent colleges and universities in California, have teaching programs whereby students are able to earn their baccalaureate degree and teaching credential in four years, and sometimes five. However, all of these programs must be approved by the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing (CTC). The CTC accredits institutions and approves programs that meet its adopted standards of quality and effectiveness. These programs span across all credential areas and include subject matter programs, educator preparation programs, and educator induction programs. Prospective candidates may enroll in CTC-approved institutions that offer approved programs to earn a credential or authorization to serve in California's public schools.

Existing successful partnership efforts on this issue have created transfer pathways that outline the exact coursework by semester that CCC and CSU level students need to take in order to earn a baccalaureate degree and teaching credential in four years. *Part of this measure appears duplicative of existing efforts and has potential to cause confusion in the field.*

Further, as currently drafted, this measure requires the participating CSU campuses and the partnering CCC districts to assign counselors to participating students to ensure they are completing the correct coursework during their participation in the pilot program, with the counselors being existing counselors who work with students to meet the requirements for an ADT, a baccalaureate degree, and a teaching credential. However, CCCs have counselors, but CSU have advisors. Changing the term “to advising” should encompass the support that both CCC and CSU provide to students.

*With the above in mind, the Committee recommends, and the author has agreed to accept, all of the following amendments:*

Section 89298.1. (a) The Chancellor of the California State University ~~and shall, in consultation with~~ the Chancellor of the California Community Colleges, shall develop a five-year pilot program to commence with the 2025–26 school year, to recruit high-quality teaching candidates at three California State University campuses in partnership with three community college campuses that apply to participate in the five-year pilot program.

(b) In developing the five-year pilot program, all of the following requirements shall apply:

(1) One pilot program shall be at a campus of the California State University that is located in a rural community.

(2) Each pilot program at a California State University campus shall partner with a community college ~~district~~ campus that has applied to participate in the pilot program and is within close proximity to the California State University campus.

~~(3) The pilot program shall comply with and build on the Student Transfer Achievement Reform Act (Article 3 (commencing with Section 66745) of Chapter 9.2 of Part 40 of Division 5).~~

(4) (A) The pilot program shall ~~implement transfer model curriculum and an associate degree for transfer at a~~ create a pathway from a community college campus that can then be

completed at a campus of the California State University that will allow, but not require, a participating student to complete a baccalaureate degree and a teaching credential in four years.

(B) The pilot program shall use dual admission ~~enrollment practices to fulfill the transfer model curriculum,~~ as needed.

(C) If a participating student completes their lower division coursework ~~associate degree for transfer~~ at a community college campus and is in good academic standing, the student shall be guaranteed admission to the teacher training program at the partnering campus of the California State University.

(5) The participating campuses of the California State University, ~~in consultation with~~ and the partnering community college ~~district~~ campuses, shall conduct marketing and outreach to local high schools to recruit a diverse pool of participating students.

(6) (A) Participating California State University campuses and the partnering community college ~~districts~~ campuses shall assign counselors provide advising to participating students to ensure they are completing the correct coursework during their participation in the pilot program.

(B) Counselors Advising assigned provided pursuant to subparagraph (A) shall ~~be existing counselors who work with~~ assist students to meet the requirements for ~~an associate degree for transfer,~~ lower division coursework, a baccalaureate degree, and a teaching credential.

Additionally, this measure, while a pilot, does not have a specified sunset date or an evaluation mechanism (i. e. reporting requirements) in order to assess the merits of the pilot.

*Moving forward, the author may wish to provide specificity as to the exact sunrise and sunset of the pilot and provide reporting requirements that will allow specified metrics to be collected and reported to appropriate entities. That is to say, the author may wish to specify measurable goals, objectives, and time frames.*

*Arguments in support.* According to EdVoice, “as with most issues facing our public schools, the difficulty of staffing qualified educators is felt most acutely by schools serving children in marginalized communities. Consistent access to high-quality, effective teachers in California is inequitably unavailable for many children of color, children with disabilities, English learners, children from low-income communities, and children who live at the intersections of these identities.”

Further, EdVoice states that, “a recent analysis of California schools found that 40% more teachers in low-income schools lack the necessary qualifications than do teachers at high-income schools. The Commission on Teacher Credentialing also published a report that highlighted the number of new teacher credentials issued in California dropped in the 2021-22 school year after several years of progress.”

Additionally, EdVoice contends that, “while efforts have been made to address the teacher shortage crisis in California, additional innovative programs are needed to ensure students in the highest-need schools have equitable access to high-quality, effective teachers. We believe SB 995 will help further address the teacher shortage crisis—and increase the racial and linguistic

diversity of teacher candidates through the five-year pilot program aimed at recruiting high-quality candidates.”

Lastly, EdVoice states that, “we are supportive of SB 995 and its focus to create more opportunities for CCC students to enter into teacher training programs offered at CSU campuses, while receiving a baccalaureate degree and a teaching credential in four years. We are also supportive of the provision in the bill that would require participating CSU and CCC schools to recruit a diverse pool of local high school students into the pilot program—establishing an organic Grow Your Own program to introduce students from local communities into the teaching profession. These provisions will allow the state to invest in innovative teacher programs and remove barriers to enter the teaching profession in order to ensure the most vulnerable children across the state have access to well-prepared teachers.”

*Arguments in concern.* Although the CCC Chancellor’s Office (CCCCO) is in support of the current version of this measure, the CCCCCO, has expressed concerns over potential changes to this measure. The CCCCCO states that, “the proposed pilot program does not provide clarity on how community colleges and CSUs can continue to scale up and implement existing teacher preparation ADTs.”

According to the CCCCCO, 70 of the 115 (brick and mortar) CCCs offer an ADT in Elementary Teacher Education (ETE), and 99 of the 115 (brick and mortar) CCCs have an ADT in Early Childhood Education. The CCCCO states that, “the CSU pathways for these majors are somewhat minimal. For example, 17 of the 23 CSUs have mapped to the ETE ADT, which is similar to the Liberal Studies major at the CSU. However, of these 17 CSU campuses, four of them are impacted.”

The CCCCO contends that, “SB 995 does not provide clarity on how the CCC can broaden these ADT pathways to make them more accessible for students. Instead, the proposed pilot requires participating colleges and CSUs to develop pathways that are specific to their regions and local needs, which could make it difficult to eventually scale the program across the state. The ADT was designed for this specific purpose; it is intended to provide a standardized framework for fulfilling lower-division requirements (with some minor variations across colleges).”

Lastly, the CCCCO states that, “SB 995 would require community colleges and CSUs to jointly develop new curriculum and modify existing curriculum, which could create significant workload. Under the current language, a general education course approved under Cal-GETC could fulfill lower-division requirements for the ADT. However, by requiring a pathway, this same course may not fulfill the same general education area(s). The participating community colleges and CSUs would need to develop new articulation agreements on how specific courses fulfill the requirements of the baccalaureate degree and teaching credential. This may require colleges to add new lower-division teacher preparation courses, or modify their existing local general education courses that are not part of Cal-GETC, to ensure it matches the specific student learning outcomes mandated by the CSU. These new courses or modifications to existing courses would need to be approved by the Chancellor’s Office. At the local level, this would also entail more complex changes to course catalogs and student advising.”

*Related legislation.* AB 2057 (Berman), which is pending a hearing on the Senate Committee on Education, in part, extends the sunset of the ADT IIC by two years, and requires the State to adopt and monitor certain goals, as specified.

*Prior legislation.* AB 928 (Berman), Chapter 566, Statutes of 2021, in part, requires the CSU and UC to jointly establish a singular lower division GE pathway for transfer admission into both segments; requires CCC to place students who declare a goal of transfer on an ADT pathway for their intended major; and, establishes the ADT IIC to serve as the primary entity charged with oversight of the ADT.

SB 440 (Padilla), Chapter 720, Statutes of 2013, requires, prior to the 2014-15 academic year, a CCC create an ADT in every major that has a TMC. Specifies that once a TMC is approved by faculty, community colleges use it to design an ADT in that particular major.

AB 2302 (Paul Fong), Chapter 427, Statutes of 2010, made changes to existing law regarding transfer admissions to support the transfer pathway proposed by SB 1440 (Padilla) (as described below).

SB 1440 (Padilla), Chapter 428, Statutes of 2010, created the STAR Act, which, in part, created the ADT; a two-year 60-unit associate degrees for transfer that are fully transferable to CSU. These degrees require completion of: (1) a minimum of 18 units in a major or area of emphasis, as determined by each community college; and, (2) an approved set of general education requirements. Students who earn such a degree are automatically eligible to transfer to the CSU system as an upper-division student in a bachelor's degree program and need only complete two additional years (an additional 60 units) of coursework to earn a bachelor's degree.

## **REGISTERED SUPPORT / OPPOSITION:**

### **Support**

Alameda County Office of Education  
Calexico Unified School District  
California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office  
California Federation of Teachers, AFT, AFL-CIO  
California Music Educators Association  
California Teachers Association  
EdVoice  
Heber Elementary School District  
San Diego County Office of Education  
San Diego Unified School District  
Southwestern Community College District  
Sweetwater Union High School District

### **Opposition**

None on file.

**Analysis Prepared by:** Jeanice Warden / HIGHER ED. / (916) 319-3960